|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| European Parliament  2019-2024 | EP logo RGB_Mute |

<Commission>{PETI}Committee on Petitions</Commission>

<Date>{17/08/2022}17.8.2022</Date>

<TitreType>NOTICE TO MEMBERS</TitreType>

Subject: <TITRE>Petition No 1064/2020 by Benedetto Rubetti (Italian) on the emission of harmful smoke by ships in the port of Portoferraio, island of Elba, Italy</TITRE>

1. Summary of petition

The petitioner claims that ships regularly sailing between Piombino and Portoferraio in Italy release an excessive amount of black smoke into the air, which is detrimental to public health. Furthermore, in his view, such harmful smoke emissions are even more of a serious problem in the summer, when several ships from different companies can sail along the Piombino-Portoferraio route at the same time. The petitioner therefore calls on the EU institutions to take action to put an end to these harmful emissions and to ensure that energy sources with a lower environmental impact are used, in order to safeguard the health of the people of the island of Elba and the tourists who stay there.

2. Admissibility

Declared admissible on 23 December 2020. Information requested from Commission under Rule 227(6).

3. Commission reply, received on 30 June 2021

The petitioner[[1]](#footnote-1) calls for future action from EU institutions to address the noxious impacts of shipping emissions on public health. In particular, he expresses concerns about the health of Elba inhabitants and tourists as during the summer there is a high density of ship port calls in Portoferraio (Elba Island, Italy) on the busy sea route Piombino-Portoferraio linking the island to the mainland. He provides photo and video material as evidence and refers to Liquid Natural Gas (LNG) as sustainable marine fuel to be taken into consideration.

The Commission’s observations

With the adoption of the European Green Deal[[2]](#footnote-2), the Commission, together with Council[[3]](#footnote-3) and European Parliament[[4]](#footnote-4), are determined to further act on the zero-pollution[[5]](#footnote-5) and climate neutrality vision[[6]](#footnote-6) for port cities and maritime transport[[7]](#footnote-7), through a variety of initiatives including investments in research and investment (R&I)[[8]](#footnote-8).

In 2021, the Commission will present a proposal for a legislative initiative called ‘FuelEU Maritime – Green European Maritime Space’[[9]](#footnote-9) to increase the use of renewable and low-carbon fuels by ships in navigation and the use of on-shore power supply (OPS or shore side electricity)[[10]](#footnote-10) or equivalent technologies for the most polluting ships at berth in EU ports. Besides the use of OPS and zero emission technologies, progress on local air pollution can also be achieved via use of LNG as a maritime fuel. However, LNG from fossil sources has limited gains in terms of greenhouse gases reduction and can be considered only as a transitional option unless it is derived from renewable sources (bio-methane and synthetic gas) until the sector will be decarbonised by 2050 also thanks to the deployment of clean fuels such as hydrogen and ammonia.

Although still limited in capacity compared to traditional fuels, LNG bunkering infrastructure and ships fuelled by LNG[[11]](#footnote-11) are technically mature and commercially available. In the past years, the Commission has put a lot of effort into the deployment of LNG with its Directive on the deployment of alternative fuels infrastructure[[12]](#footnote-12), which has required Member States to establish national policy frameworks for the market development of alternative fuels and their infrastructure, including electricity for vehicles, CNG (compressed natural gas), LNG for vehicles, for maritime and inland vessels. In particular, Member States are required to put in place a sufficient number of LNG refuelling points at core maritime and inland ports by the end of 2025 and 2030 respectively. As a result, refuelling facilities for vessels are in place in several ports in the north of Europe[[13]](#footnote-13). Substantial progress was also made in the western Mediterranean[[14]](#footnote-14), including Livorno. The Commission is currently reviewing the Directive on the deployment of alternative fuels infrastructure to accelerate the use of on-shore power supply across EU ports.

In this context, a significant number of projects addressing these objectives have been funded under the former Trans-European Transport Network (TEN-T) programme (2007-2013), the Connecting Europe Facility (CEF, 2014-2020)[[15]](#footnote-15), as well as Horizon 2020[[16]](#footnote-16),[[17]](#footnote-17). Under the CEF programme, Italy has been granted EUR 53 million for LNG & OPS maritime investments, making it one of the main beneficiaries in the Mediterranean to enhance the deployment of LNG as a marine fuel. In particular through the GAINN[[18]](#footnote-18) Actions and Poseidon Med II[[19]](#footnote-19) support was provided for LNG technical designs, the piloting of LNG solutions on vessels and implementing LNG reloading facilities at key Italian ports. The Commission has also provided support for the construction of an LNG coastal depot in the Port of Naples[[20]](#footnote-20).

In addition, in the coming months the Commission is planning to launch, under Horizon Europe[[21]](#footnote-21), a co-programmed partnership on Zero-Emission Waterborne Transport[[22]](#footnote-22). The partnership, expected with EU investment (grants) of EUR 530 million and private contribution of around EUR 3 billion, is expected to demonstrate deployable, zero-emission solutions for all main ship types before 2030.

Italy is implementing the Directive on the deployment of alternative fuels infrastructure and launched the development of the national LNG distribution infrastructure, based on primary and secondary LNG storage points, and various LNG transportation systems. Italy’s effort focused on ensuring a significant future demand for LNG also in Italian ports since currently LNG terminals do not supply services to ships. Due to recent investment in the cruise industry, launching new vessels powered by LNG due to call in Italian ports, and to cope with overall projected demand for LNG as a marine fuel, a significant venture on the supply side has started in Italy with an ambitious programme to build a bunker vessel capable of supplying LNG as fuel to the large cruise ships that will soon begin operation.

Existing LNG refuelling facilities are located in the western Mediterranean, notably in France, Spain and Algeria. While the ports of La Spezia and Livorno (Tuscany) have import facilities and terminals, Italy plans to have in operation 11 small-scale LNG receiving terminals around its coasts by the early 2020s, including at the Sardinian west coast port of Oristano[[23]](#footnote-23). All terminals would provide LNG marine bunkering and road tanker loading services while six of them would also refuel with LNG on site and feed gas into local pipelines. To refuel ships, the terminals will be able to reload LNG bunker vessels as well as receive cargoes.

Furthermore, the Commission allows Member States to provide State aid to support new, or the (environmental) upgrade of existing short sea shipping services in order to create a modal shift from road to sea transportation. In this context, the Italian scheme ‘Marebonus’[[24]](#footnote-24) provides EUR 138 million grants to ship owners for this objective.

In 2021, in parallel with the FuelEU Maritime initiative mentioned above, the Commission will also adopt measures aiming at making ship energy operation and design more efficient[[25]](#footnote-25), reviewing taxation of electricity in ports a well as the current tax exemptions and subsidies on fossil fuels[[26]](#footnote-26), including for marine fuels, extending the emission trading systems to maritime transport[[27]](#footnote-27) and creating additional emission control areas (ECAs) for sulphur and nitrogen oxides in EU seas. In this context, a Commission report[[28]](#footnote-28) shows the success of the ECAs in the Baltic and North Sea with air quality in relevant coastal areas improved without any noticeable negative impact on the shipping industry and its customers across the EU. In 2021, the designation of an ECA in the Mediterranean Sea may be proposed by the riparian states, with the active support of the Italian government in the framework of the Barcelona Convention[[29]](#footnote-29), to the International Maritime Organization for further approval by the end of 2022 and possible entering into force after 2025.

The Commission issued a *Green Deal* Call under Horizon 2020[[30]](#footnote-30) aiming at Research and Innovation to support the EU’s transition to a carbon-free economy by 2050. Under the specific subtopic of green airports and ports as multimodal hubs for sustainable and smart mobility with €100 million[[31]](#footnote-31), 28 proposals were submitted as innovation actions for green ports, and are expected to further enhance the technology maturity of solutions to green shipping.

As announced in the European Green Deal2 the Commission will also propose to revise air quality standards set out in the Ambient Air Quality Directive[[32]](#footnote-32) to align them more closely with the World Health Organization (WHO) recommendations, drawing on the lessons learnt from the evaluation of the current air quality legislation[[33]](#footnote-33). Air quality standards under the Ambient Air Quality Directives include limit values for a variety of air pollutants including nitrogen dioxides (NO2) and particulate matter (PM). The Directive referred to sets, for NO2, an annual limit value of 40 micrograms per cubic metre (µg/m³), for PM10 a daily limit value of 50 µg/m³ not to be exceeded more than 35 times a calendar year, and an annual limit value of 40 µg/m³. For PM2.5, the Directive sets an annual limit value of 25 µg/m³.

If the set limit values are exceeded, Member States are required to adopt air quality plans detailing measures apt to keep the exceedance period as short as possible. In doing so, Member States are required to adopt appropriate measures to address the existing sources of air pollution in their territory, including for ships in ports or sailing in coastal areas. While road transport is the major source of air pollution, some EU ports have opted to install on-shore power supply or alternative fuels refuelling facilities in their ports to cater for the energy needs of ships with zero emissions. Italy is also planning under the Recovery Plan to invest in port electrification in its largest ports[[34]](#footnote-34) such as Napoli, Gioia Tauro, La Spezia, Livorno and Genoa.

Currently, on-shore power supply is not available widely in Italian ports. The air quality regional Plan for Tuscany[[35]](#footnote-35), which includes the island of Elba, covers the supply of on-shore power at the port of Livorno as part of the “Agreement with Port Authority and Harbourmaster’s Office to reduce the environmental impacts”. Beside Livorno, the ports of Piombino and Marina di Carrara are also considering the installation of OPSs. The Plan also includes the further deployment of LNG as fuel, including for the shipping sector, and for the future deployment of hydrogen.

In case of non-compliance with limit values, the Commission is entitled to pursue an infringement against Member States, and is currently doing so in respect of Italy. Accordingly, the Commission decided on 17 May 2018 to refer Italy to the Court of Justice of the European Union for exceedances of particulate matter limit values[[36]](#footnote-36) and on 7 March 2019 for exceedances of NO2 limit values[[37]](#footnote-37). Moreover, on 30 October 2020 the Commission issued a Letter of Formal Notice against Italy in relation to exceedances of limit values established for fine particulate matter[[38]](#footnote-38). However, according to the reporting of pollutant concentrations in the air quality zone IT908, which includes the island of Elba, there has been no reported exceedances neither for NO2 or PM10 in the last years, as measured by the two monitoring stations located close to the port of Piombino which, however, do not monitor PM2.5.

Conclusion

It follows from the above that the Commission addresses ship pollution and would like to inform the petitioner that, besides existing legislation, several initiatives have been launched that respond to his concerns, including for forward-looking research and innovation, and these are also largely implemented in Italy and Tuscany including on LNG and shore side electricity.

4. Commission reply (REV), received on 17 August 2022

The petitioner adds questions to his petition concerning the impacts of maritime traffic air pollution in the Elba’s island following the reply sent by the Italian authorities on 2nd March 2022[[39]](#footnote-39). Based on the information provided, he keeps underlining that the location of air pollutants’ monitoring stations is too far from Portoferraio and that the measured concentration values may not duly capture the effective contribution by ships during the whole summer period. Therefore, he asks the Italian authorities[[40]](#footnote-40) to provide further access to more pollutants’ concentration data in the Elba’s island to assess the contribution from seasonal ship’s traffic on the busy sea route Piombino-Portoferraio linking the island to the mainland. He also asks that a fixed monitoring station is installed in Portoferraio to this end.

The Commission’s observations

In reply to the petition[[41]](#footnote-41),the Commission provided a very comprehensive illustration of ongoing EU initiatives and actions addressing ship emissions to deliver on the European Green Deal and its zero pollution and climate neutrality commitments, including for port cities and maritime transport. The Commission also presented those initiatives, including those under the ‘Fit for 55’ package, at the meeting of the European Parliament’s PETI Committee on 27 January 2022. In the ensuing discussion, focusing on the specific application of the EU air quality standards, the Committee decided that the petition should be kept open.

The issue of the monitoring stations’ location was raised at the meeting[[42]](#footnote-42). The fact that island of Elba is not exceeding air quality standards under EU legislation[[43]](#footnote-43), especially during the summer period, was questioned as possibly linked to the excessive distance of the monitoring stations from Portoferraio. In fact, these are located at around 30 km distance in the proximity of Piombino’s port in the mainland. In this case, the measured concentrations for a variety of air pollutants may not reflect the potentially high contribution by ships on the route Piombino-Portoferraio. While the Commission questioned the relevance of where the monitoring station is located, the Committee nevertheless called for urgent short-term action by the national local authorities to rectify the situation.

Accordingly, the Committee agreed to send a letter to the competent Italian authorities, i.e. the Ministry of Ecological Transition and the Tuscan Region, calling for urgent action. The latter was sent on 3rd February 2022. In general, the Commission is of the opinion that such action should also provide, if needed, an assessment of the monitoring station’s location to determine if they allow distinguishing the contribution of ships from that of land pollution sources, since road transport also increases in the summer period. In the negative case, the stations should be relocated closer to the port area, new data collected, assessed and shared with the Commission and the petitioner[[44]](#footnote-44).

In relation to the placement of monitoring stations, however, the Commission also stresses that the primary responsibility for correctly implementing EU law, including the correct siting of sampling points, lies with the Member States, and the competent authorities they designated. Portoferraio, located in the Elba Island is included under air quality zone IT908. This air quality zone includes sampling points in the city of Piombino (measuring nitrogen dioxides, particulate matter (PM10), benzene and lead) and in the city of Livorno (measuring fine particulate matter (PM2.5)). Directive 2008/50[[45]](#footnote-45) lays down detailed rules for the use and location of sampling points to measure air quality in zones and agglomerations established by the Member States. According to paragraph 1(a) of Section B of Annex III to this Directive, sampling points directed at the protection of human health shall be sited in such a way as to provide data on the following:

 the areas within zones and agglomerations where the highest concentrations occur to which the population is likely to be directly or indirectly exposed for a period which is significant in relation to the averaging period of the limit value(s),

 levels in other areas within the zones and agglomerations which are representative of the exposure of the general population.

It also establishes under paragraph (1)f, that sampling points shall, where possible, also be representative of similar locations not in their immediate vicinity.

In this particular case, it is for the Italian authorities to ensure air quality monitoring in air quality zone IT908 which includes the island of Elba, as well as several coastal cities close to the island of Elba (such as the cities of Livorno and Piombino). There is no legal requirement to place an air quality sampling point on the island itself, as long as the requirements of the Directive as regards to the placement of sampling points, in particular those related to Annex III as regards the requirement to provide data on the highest concentrations to which the population is likely to be directly or indirectly exposed. In the view of the Commission, it is still not clear from the petition why it should be assumed that the air quality in the port city of Portoferraio should be worse than in the port city of Piombino, the latter being a busier maritime port during the summer and with additional maritime connecting Piombino with other Italian main ports (Sardinia, Sicily, etc.).

In view of the above and the current design of the monitoring network by the competent authorities, the Commission does not have evidence that the national authorities infringed their obligations under the Air Quality Directive in this area in a systematic or serious manner. The Commission notes that the petitioner has already received information from competent authorities including air pollutants concentration data for campaigns carried out in 2020 (4 September - 19 October) and in 2021 (7 July - 14 September) during representative summer months including traffic for both, cars and ships. The Commission also notes that such data were in addition measured from a dedicated mobile monitoring station in Portoferraio. However, the Commission understands that the petitioner remains unsatisfied with the information received and the fact that the monitoring campaign was performed in years with possibly lower touristic activity than in the past or the current year due to the COVID-19 pandemic and reiterates his request for additional data from the mobile station if any, likely available in his view, and covering the whole of 2020, to include the summer period, and of 2021 in Portoferraio. He also asks to install a fixed monitoring station in Portoferraio. As all requested measured data are not available, the Italian authorities could launch new monitoring campaigns during the summer period, to ensure that the situation does not worsen due to a probable increase in traffic due touristic activity after the COVID-19 pandemic.

Conclusion

The primary responsibility for correctly implementing EU law, including the correct siting of sampling points, lies with the Member States. The Commission is therefore of the opinion that the national administrative and/or judicial bodies in charge of its implementation are primarily responsible to verify specific situations of non-compliance, including compliance with the monitoring regime established in the Ambient Air Quality Directives, and have the means appropriate to address the problem if the concerns are found justified.

The Commission continues to closely monitor the implementation of the Ambient Air Quality Directives and if/where persistent breaches of air quality standards occur, these are being followed up by the Commission through various means – including via Clean Air Dialogues (for Italy, such a Clean Air Dialogue took place in June 2019) and through infringement procedures against the Member States concerned. For Italy, three infringement procedures related to exceedances of air quality standards are open, for which for two (exceedances of the limit values of NO2 and PM10) the Court of Justice of the European Union (CJEU) ruled that Italy has been in breach of obligations arising from Article 13 and Article 23 of the Ambient Air Quality Directive). The air quality zone IT908 is not included in these infringement cases.

Ships pollution is already addressed through existing legislation and initiatives. Besides, new EU initiatives have been adopted under the European Green Deal, which respond to the petitioner’s concerns. Finally, following up its PETI Committee’s meeting held on the original petition in January 2022, the European Parliament sent a letter to the Italian competent authorities on 2 February 2022 to urge the them to take short-term actions, including deploying zero emission fuels and technologies, to address ship emissions and to inform accordingly both, the petitioner and the Commission. While the petitioner already received data from the Italian authorities for representative months for 2020-2021 from a dedicated mobile monitoring station located in Portoferraio, he requests to receive data from the latter over a whole period 2020-2021 year that a fixed monitoring station is installed in Portoferraio. While further data, for the period 2020-2021 measured from the dedicated mobile station in Portoferraio can’t be sent to the petitioner as they are not available, the Commission is of the view that new data from a new monitoring station would also not be needed as the density of maritime transport along the shipping route Porteferraio-Piombino is similar in both ports and higher in Piombino being this a bigger port. Being mindful that in Portoferraio/Piombino there are no infringements with respect to applicable EU air quality standards, the relocation of the Piombino’s monitoring station closer to the port, or in different suitable positions within the port itself, could be considered by Tuscany’s region, if need be, with the view to better assess the effective contribution to air pollution from ships and single out this contribution from the one coming from other sources. Nevertheless, future monitoring campaigns during the summer period could also be considered by the Italian authorities.

Finally, the Commission notes that the Port Authority for the Northern Tyrrhenian Sea has adopted medium term plans[[46]](#footnote-46) to install on-shore power supply in the region’s ports, which will allow to deliver on the Green Deal, and in particular on the EU’s Fit for 55 initiative by substantially reducing ship emissions.

1. The petitioner presented in 2019 the petition  0248/2019 objecting to the construction of a desalination plant to provide the island of Elba with an independent water supply [↑](#footnote-ref-1)
2. COM(2019) 640 final. The document states ‘It will take action in relation to maritime transport, including to regulate access of the most polluting ships to EU ports and to oblige docked ships to use shore-side electricity. Similarly, air quality should be improved near airports by tackling the emissions of pollutants by aeroplanes and airport operations’. [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
3. <https://www.consilium.europa.eu/media/44311/st08648-en20.pdf> [↑](#footnote-ref-3)
4. Draft European Parliament Committee on the Environment, Public Health and Food Safety opinion 2019/2193(INI) on technical and operational measures for more efficient and cleaner maritime transport. [↑](#footnote-ref-4)
5. Action Plan for Zero Pollution in Air, Water and Soil – adopted on 12 May 2021<https://ec.europa.eu/environment/strategy/zero-pollution-action-plan_en>. The plan promotes a holistic approach to pollution from ships also looking into impacts from deposition of ship emission on water acidification and eutrophication. [↑](#footnote-ref-5)
6. EU policies and initiatives are reflected at national level in the Italy’s National Integrated Plan for Climate and Energy 2030 established by the Ministry of Economic Development (MISE) in 2019. <https://ec.europa.eu/energy/sites/ener/files/documents/it_final_necp_main_en.pdf> [↑](#footnote-ref-6)
7. Strategy for Sustainable and Smart Mobility, COM(2020) 789 final, SWD(2020) 331 final. [↑](#footnote-ref-7)
8. Upcoming projects <https://www.waterborne.eu/images/documents/200527_Zero-Emission_Waterborne_Transport_Proposal_Final_Version_Spread.pdf> [↑](#footnote-ref-8)
9. <https://ec.europa.eu/info/law/better-regulation/have-your-say/initiatives/12312-FuelEU-Maritime> [↑](#footnote-ref-9)
10. According to the [European Alternative Fuels Observatory](https://www.eafo.eu/) there are currently 34 high-voltage OPS installations in maritime ports in Europe. [↑](#footnote-ref-10)
11. Info on LNG ships can be found here: <https://eafo.eu/shipping-transport/seagoing-vessels/lng-fuelled-vessels/overview>. According to Clarksons Research, as of mid-September 2020, on a global basis, 584 LNG-capable and 203 LNG-ready vessels were in the fleet and 368 LNG-capable and 52 LNG-ready vessels had been ordered. [↑](#footnote-ref-11)
12. Directive 2014/94/EU of the European Parliament and of the Council of 22 October 2014 on the deployment of alternative fuels infrastructure Text with EEA relevance, OJ L 307, 28.10.2014, p. 1–20. [↑](#footnote-ref-12)
13. In Sweden, Finland, Belgium, the Netherlands and the United Kingdom and Norway, with short term plans in Germany, and Denmark. [↑](#footnote-ref-13)
14. In France, Spain, Italy. In the Eastern Mediterranean basin, Greece has also plans for the near future. [↑](#footnote-ref-14)
15. <https://ec.europa.eu/inea/en/connecting-europe-facility> [↑](#footnote-ref-15)
16. <https://ec.europa.eu/info/horizon-europe-next-research-and-innovation-framework-programme_en> [↑](#footnote-ref-16)
17. Upcoming projects <https://www.waterborne.eu/images/documents/200527_Zero-Emission_Waterborne_Transport_Proposal_Final_Version_Spread.pdf> [↑](#footnote-ref-17)
18. [https://ec.europa.eu/inea/en/connecting-europe-facility/cef-transport/2014-IT-TM-0450-](https://ec.europa.eu/inea/en/connecting-europe-facility/cef-transport/2014-IT-TM-0450-s)S

    [https://ec.europa.eu/inea/en/connecting-europe-facility/cef-transport/2017-EU-TM-0062-](https://ec.europa.eu/inea/en/connecting-europe-facility/cef-transport/2017-EU-TM-0062-w)

    <https://ec.europa.eu/inea/en/connecting-europe-facility/cef-transport/2017-IT-TM-0066-W>

    <https://ec.europa.eu/inea/en/connecting-europe-facility/cef-transport/2014-EU-TM-0698-M>

    <https://ec.europa.eu/inea/en/connecting-europe-facility/cef-transport/2017-IT-TM-0154-W> [↑](#footnote-ref-18)
19. <https://ec.europa.eu/inea/en/connecting-europe-facility/cef-transport/2014-EU-TM-0673-S> [↑](#footnote-ref-19)
20. <https://ec.europa.eu/inea/en/connecting-europe-facility/cef-transport/2019-IT-TM-0112-S> [↑](#footnote-ref-20)
21. EU Research and Innovation Framework Program for years 2021-27 <https://ec.europa.eu/info/horizon-europe_en> [↑](#footnote-ref-21)
22. <https://ec.europa.eu/info/sites/info/files/research_and_innovation/funding/documents/european_partnership_for_zero-emission_waterborne_transport.pdf> [↑](#footnote-ref-22)
23. About HiGas. <https://www.offshore-energy.biz/italys-1st-small-scale-lng-terminal-nearing-completion/> [↑](#footnote-ref-23)
24. [www.ramspa.it/sites/default/files/allegati/mosincentives\_en.pdf](http://www.ramspa.it/sites/default/files/allegati/mosincentives_en.pdf) [↑](#footnote-ref-24)
25. Currently under development in the framework of the International Maritime Organization. [↑](#footnote-ref-25)
26. Revision of Directive 2003/96/EC restructuring the Community framework for the taxation of energy products and electricity, <https://ec.europa.eu/info/law/better-regulation/have-your-say/initiatives/12227-EU-Green-Deal-Revision-of-the-Energy-Taxation-Directive> [↑](#footnote-ref-26)
27. By revising existing legislation to extend the European Emissions Trading System to the maritime sector <https://ec.europa.eu/info/law/better-regulation/have-your-say/initiatives/12660-Updating-the-EU-Emissions-Trading-System> [↑](#footnote-ref-27)
28. <https://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-content/EN/TXT/?uri=CELEX:52018DC0188> [↑](#footnote-ref-28)
29. Decision of 21st meeting of the Conference of the Parties of the Barcelona Convention in Naples in December 2019, to present in 2022 a proposal to the International Maritime Organization designate of a SOx ECA in the Mediterranean Sea. [↑](#footnote-ref-29)
30. <https://ec.europa.eu/programmes/horizon2020/en/news/european-green-deal-call> [↑](#footnote-ref-30)
31. <https://ec.europa.eu/inea/en/news-events/newsroom/h2020-call-european-green-deal-300-project-proposals-competing-eur-286-million> [↑](#footnote-ref-31)
32. Directive 2008/50/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council of 21 May 2008 on ambient air quality and cleaner air for Europe, OJ L 152, 11.6.2008, p. 1–44. [↑](#footnote-ref-32)
33. Fitness check of the Ambient Air Quality Directives, SWD(2019) 427. [↑](#footnote-ref-33)
34. <https://www.huffingtonpost.it/entry/recovery-plan-italiano-cancellata-dal-testo-la-super-task-force-ecco-i-progetti_it_5fe38164c5b6ff74797f724b> [↑](#footnote-ref-34)
35. https://www.regione.toscana.it/documents/10180/24014/Allegato+A+PRQA+Parte+1-4+e+allegati.pdf/f11aa674-db16-4d9c-8723-d432d52c3819 [↑](#footnote-ref-35)
36. <https://ec.europa.eu/commission/presscorner/detail/en/ip_18_3450> , case C-644/18. In the context of this case, Italy was condemned by the Court of Justice on 20 November 2020: <https://curia.europa.eu/jcms/upload/docs/application/pdf/2020-11/cp200136en.pdf> [↑](#footnote-ref-36)
37. <https://ec.europa.eu/commission/presscorner/detail/en/IP_19_1475>, case C-573/19. [↑](#footnote-ref-37)
38. <https://ec.europa.eu/commission/presscorner/detail/en/inf_20_1687> [↑](#footnote-ref-38)
39. Nota protocollare 5003 of 2 March 2022 from the Italian Ministry of Ecological Transition, including documentation from the Region of Tuscany entrusting ARPAT ([www.arpat.toscana.it](http://www.arpat.toscana.it)) with the air pollution monitoring in the area in question. [↑](#footnote-ref-39)
40. Italian Ministry of the Ecological Transition, the Region of Tuscany and ARPAT [↑](#footnote-ref-40)
41. https://www.europarl.europa.eu/doceo/document/PETI-CM-695208\_EN.pdf [↑](#footnote-ref-41)
42. By the honourable MEP Ms Evi (Greens/IT) [↑](#footnote-ref-42)
43. According to the reporting of pollutant concentrations in the air quality zone IT908, which includes the island of Elba, there has been no reported exceedances neither for NO2 or PM10 in the last years, as measured by the two monitoring stations located close to the port of Piombino which, however, do not monitor PM2.5. [↑](#footnote-ref-43)
44. The petition is covered by the Italian press. <https://www.ansa.it/europa/notizie/la_tua_europa/notizie/2022/01/24/alleurocamera-la-battaglia-contro-i-fumi-delle-navi-allisola-delba_97719500-c813-45c9-83eb-23dbcb6b786d.html> [↑](#footnote-ref-44)
45. Directive 2008/50/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council of 21 May 2008 on ambient air quality and cleaner air for Europe, OJ L 152, 11.6.2008, p. 1–44; <https://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-content/en/ALL/?uri=CELEX%3A32008L0050> [↑](#footnote-ref-45)
46. https://www.portialtotirreno.it/wp-content/uploads/2020/06/DEASP-GENNAIO2020.pdf [↑](#footnote-ref-46)